

# Case Law Concordance: Decisions to Topics

By Rev. Luan-Vu “Lui” Tran, Ph.D.

## How to Use this Case Law Concordance

**What this is:** a reverse lookup that maps each Judicial Council Decision/Memorandum (JCD/JCM)—with its year—to the topical keywords used in your ***Topical Index of Statutory & Case Law***. Use it alongside the Topical Index for fast, bidirectional research.

### *Reverse lookup cases*

- You have a decision number (e.g., from a memo or brief) and need the relevant topics and BOD anchors → find the number here, then jump back to those topics in the *Topical Index*.
- You’re building a table of authorities → this list gives you number + year + keywords so you can slot entries under multiple headings consistently.

### *Citation & notation tips*

- Format: JCD 1512 (2024) or JCM 1452 (2023); add pincites when quoting.
- Tie to Discipline: After the decision, parenthetically reference the pertinent BoD ¶¶ (e.g., JCD 1512 (2024) (¶2549, ¶2501 trust clause)).
- Signal narrowing/overruling: Note if later JCDs refine the holding (e.g., “clarified by JCD 1517 (2025)”).

### *Quality control checklist*

- Confirm years where historical sources vary; resolve with the official JC docket or published volumes.
- Watch renumbering & paragraph shifts between BOD editions; always cite the edition you’re using.
- Double check if a JCD has been clarified or reconsidered in a later JCM.
- Scan for moot/hypothetical rulings—they carry limited precedential weight.

## Research pattern to remember

### **Topic → Cases (Topical Index) ↔ Case → Topics (This Concordance)**

Work both directions, fast: begin **Topic → Cases** by anchoring to the exact BOD ¶¶, pull every relevant JCD/JCM, and jot a one-sentence rule for each with its authority (Constitution vs. BoD), posture (question of law, petition, appeal), and recency/treatment flags. Then pivot **Case → Topics** by tagging each decision to all secondary subjects it touches (e.g., standing rules, consent calendars, trustees/¶2549), noting where it narrows, distinguishes, or strengthens another line. Close the loop by ensuring those secondary topics list the same case and adding a brief “why it matters” note. This tight, bidirectional pass catches omissions, surfaces cross-topic implications, and forges a cleaner rule block for argument and rebuttal.

- **JCD 7 (1940)** — Retirement & Status of Retired Clergy.
- **JCD 17 (1944)** — Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (committees on appeal/costs).
- **JCD 28 (1944)** — Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (boundaries).
- **JCD 30 (1944)** — Apportionments & Connectional Giving.
- **JCD 57 (1948)** — Jurisdictional & Central Conferences; Episcopal Areas & Boundaries (who fixes episcopal-area boundaries).
- **JCD 72 (1950)** — Ordination Standards; Candidacy & Membership in Conference (education timing / membership requirements).
- **JCD 87 (1952)** — Retirement & Status of Retired Clergy (vote as full member of AC).
- **JCD 96 (1953)** — Book of Discipline (Status/Authority); Discipline Enforcement & Compliance.
- **JCD 112 (1955)** — Charge Conference (lay member eligibility).
- **JCD 116 (1955)** — Church Trials (supervisory/judicial boundaries).
- **JCD 117 (1955)** — Bishops (retired bishops' participation/expenses at COB).
- **JCD 119 (1955)** — Annual Conference (standing rules binding); Building Projects (use of proceeds).
- **JCD 125 (1956)** — Delegates & Elections (order of election → reserves).
- **JCD 130 (1956)** — Charge Conference (trustees elections policy subject to session).
- **JCD 138 (1957)** — Church Closures & Discontinuance (AC trustees dispose of assets).
- **JCD 142 (1957)** — Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (adaptation cannot alter doctrines).
- **JCD 147 (1958)** — Adaptation Powers; Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (limits under Constitution/GC).
- **JCD 157 (1959)** — Ordination Standards (BOM duty; conference authority).
- **JCD 165 (1960)** — Retirement & Status (annuity eligibility).

- **JCD 170 (1961)** — Church Membership (transfer certificates).
- **JCD 181 (1960)** — Retirement & Status (expenses/supply).
- **JCD 213 (1964)** — Retirement & Status (expense categorization).
- **JCD 254 (1967)** — Delegates & Elections (must be member at time of service).
- **JCD 308 (1969)** — Delegates & Elections (transfer before GC/JC/CC → cannot be seated).
- **JCD 310 (1969)** — Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (committees on appeal structure).
- **JCD 313 (1969)** — Adaptation Powers; Ordination Standards; Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (GC sets standards; ACs apply).
- **JCD 318 (1969)** — Ordination Standards (no extra obligations beyond Discipline).
- **JCD 319 (1969)** — Charge Conference (electing lay members; “basic unit”).
- **JCD 320 (1969)** — Charge Conference (board acts under CC; budgets/apportionments).
- **JCD 344 (1971)** — Ordination Standards (admit without BOM rec only if all requirements met).
- **JCD 345 (1971)** — Extension Ministries (annual compensation reporting; journal publication).
- **JCD 363 (1972)** — Deacons & Elders (elder in full connection prerequisite to episcopacy).
- **JCD 366 (1972)** — Deacons & Elders (voluntary location/lay pastor status).
- **JCD 398 (1975)** — Annual Conference (districts: AC sets number; bishop forms/appoints).
- **JCD 399 (1975)** — Building Projects (no mortgaging for current expenses).
- **JCD 416 (1976)** — Episcopal Areas & Boundaries (assignment terms/effective dates).
- **JCD 417 (1976)** — Book of Discipline (Status/Authority) (GC’s full legislative power).
- **JCD 440 (1978)** — Cabinet & Superintendency (DS supervision in formation).
- **JCD 444 (1978)** — Ordination Standards (recognition of orders/transfer procedures).
- **JCD 456 (1979)** — Apportionments & Connectional Giving (at discontinuance).

- **JCD 465 (1979–80)** — Extension Ministries (accountability/reporting).
- **JCD 467 (1979)** — Elections (AC nomination rights to jurisdiction).
- **JCD 476 (1980)** — Annual Conference (standing rules harmonized with Discipline).
- **JCD 492 (1980)** — Cabinet & Superintendency; Consultation; Deacons & Elders (right to appointment; consultation).
- **JCD 497 (1981)** — Church Trials (ex parte communication → new trial).
- **JCD 501 (1981)** — Consultation (mandatory/advisory; timing; notification).
- **JCD 504 (1981)** — Church Trials (new trial not limited to penalty).
- **JCD 517 (1982)** — Episcopal Areas & Boundaries (jurisdiction cannot fix areas by final action).
- **JCD 539 (1984)** — Annual Conference (no post-adoption budget reallocation delegation).
- **JCD 542 (1984)** — Ordination Standards (conference decides if qualifications met).
- **JCD 556 (1985)** — Consultation (cooperative parish context).
- **JCD 558 (1985)** — Retirement & Status (rights/eligibility incl. exec session).
- **JCD 592 (1988)** — Elections; Annual Conference (no mandatory delegate voting-record disclosures).
- **JCD 664 (1991)** — Building Projects (no mortgaging/sale proceeds for current expenses).
- **JCD 672 (1992)** — Connectional Entities (funding UM Foundation president).
- **JCD 688 (1993)** — Board of Trustees; Building Projects; Church Closures (abandoned/discontinued property with AC trustees; renumbering).
- **JCD 689 (1993)** — Fair Process (unclear procedures violate due process).
- **JCD 690 (1993)** — Candidacy & Membership in Conference (clergy session rights).
- **JCD 696 (1993)** — Church Membership (no dual membership; termination upon transfer).
- **JCD 702 (1993)** — Book of Discipline / Constitutional Governance (inclusiveness applied structurally).

- **JCD 713 (1994)** — Deacons & Elders (appointment eligibility—insurance premiums).
- **JCD 717 (1994)** — Retirement & Status (benefit eligibility).
- **JCD 720 (1994)** — Connectional Entities (reliance on Wespath/actuarial figures).
- **JCD 741 (1994)** — Discontinuance of Clergy (withdrawal under complaint null if time-barred).
- **JCD 753 (1995)** — Discontinuance of Clergy (time-barred → nullity principle).
- **JCD 798 (1996)** — Discontinuance of Clergy (withdrawal under complaint effective immediately).
- **JCD 823 (1998)** — Annual Conference (basic body; spheres of authority).
- **JCD 830 (1998)** — Fair Process (constitutional right extends beyond trials).
- **JCD 831 (1998)** — Annual Conference (no unilateral restructure under GC-reserved powers; bishop not voting member).
- **JCD 846 (1998)** — Church Trials (improper declaratory requests via rulings of law).
- **JCD 847 (1998)** — Book of Discipline / Connectional Identity (avoid official ID with unofficial bodies).
- **JCD 871 (1999)** — Book of Discipline / Connectional Identity (applies 847).
- **JCD 877 (1999)** — Extension Ministries; Deacons & Elders (extension appointments scope; orders distinct).
- **JCD 904 (2000)** — Adaptation Powers (GC-mandated structures preempt adaptation).
- **JCD 917 (2001)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (separation of functions; fair process).
- **JCD 920 (2001)** — Constitutional/Standards Review (implements JCD 544 framework; fair-process safeguards).
- **JCD 935 (2002)** — Wespath/Benefits Relations (health benefits redesign compliant).
- **JCD 947 (2002)** — Connectional Entities (budget must include all anticipated income; publication rules).
- **JCM 950 (2002)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (limits DS/bishop participation in certain hearings).

- **JCD 963 (2003)** — Wespath/Benefits Relations (deposit vs past-service funding accounts).
- **JCD 976 (2003)** — Wespath/Benefits Relations (allocations; donor intent).
- **JCD 982 (2004)** — Discontinuance of Clergy (admin location/fair process preserved).
- **JCD 986 (2004)** — Apportionments & Connectional Giving (pastor's unwillingness ≠ chargeable offense).
- **JCD 1010 (2005)** — Discontinuance of Clergy (admin location reversed—fair process).
- **JCD 1032 (2005)** — Church Membership (pastor's discretion re readiness).
- **JCM 1041 (2006)** — Church Membership (clarifies JCD 1032 within ¶4).
- **JCD 1054 (2006)** — Apportionments; Connectional Entities (no “tithe method” in lieu of apportioned amounts).
- **JCD 1055 (2006)** — Discontinuance of Clergy; Discipline Compliance (withdrawal effects; nullity when no valid complaint).
- **JCD 1094 (2008)** — Appeals & Judicial Process (two-question appellate standard).
- **JCD 1101 (2008)** — Retirement & Status (retired local pastors not clergy members when not appointed).
- **JCD 1105 (2009)** — Discipline Enforcement & Compliance (AC rules may not conflict with Discipline).
- **JCD 1121 (2009)** — Apportionments & Connectional Giving (first benevolent responsibility; DS notice).
- **JCD 1126 (2009)** — Retirement & Status (retired elder as finance chair; AC vs local membership rights).
- **JCM 1129 (2009)** — Wespath/Benefits Relations (plan sponsor/administrator interplay; jurisdiction declined).
- **JCD 1146 (2010)** — Connectional Entities (no budget devices to reduce GC apportionments).
- **JCD 1151 (2010)** — Appeals & Judicial Process; Church Trials (two-question standard; record limits).
- **JCD 1172 (2010)** — Connectional Entities (conference must apportion full GC amounts).

- **JCD 1174 (2010)** — Consultation; Cabinet & Superintendency (timing/nature of consultation).
- **JCM 1186 (2011)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (no advisory rulings pre-AC action).
- **JCD 1201 (2011)** — Church Trials (reinstatement denied; due process sufficiency).
- **JCD 1208 (2012)** — Connectional Entities (Episcopal Fund/apportionment structure—GC authority).
- **JCD 1210 (2012)** — Book of Discipline; Discipline Compliance (Plan UMC unconstitutional; severability limits).
- **JCD 1218 (2012)** — Discipline Enforcement & Compliance (all entities bound by Discipline).
- **JCD 1226 (2012)** — Appointments & Consultation; Cabinet & Superintendency; Deacons & Elders; Discontinuance (security of appointment; limits on non-continuation).
- **JCD 1257 (2013)** — Annual Conference (no interim corporate/budget actions later “legitimated” via consent calendar).
- **JCM 1276 (2014)** — Constitutional/Procedural (judicial restraint; GC must fix admin processes).
- **JCD 1271 (2014)** — Annual Conference (conference unification/reorganization process).
- **JCD 1272 (2014)** — Adaptation Powers (¶31 authority; GC full power; ¶101 non-adaptables).
- **JCM 1301 (2015)** — Cabinet & Superintendency (appointive cabinet structuring w/ consultation safeguards).
- **JCM 1302 (2015)** — Annual Conference (district conferences part of AC; organization rules).
- **JCD 1307 (2015)** — Appointments & Consultation; Cabinet & Superintendency; Bishops (consultation duties; bishop retains fixing authority).
- **JCD 1311 (2016)** — Annual Conference (no bishop-created task force reporting directly to AC).
- **JCD 1312 (2016)** — Bishops (episcopacy under GC’s connectional authority); Episcopal Areas & Boundaries (allocations/roles).
- **JCD 1315 (2016)** — Church Trials (charge specificity; record; counsel issues).
- **JCD 1321 (2016)** — Constitutional Allocation (¶16 vs ¶33 roles consistent).

- **JCD 1328 (2016)** — Elections (nominating slates cannot foreclose bodies' self-elections).
- **JCD 1330 (2016)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (must ascertain all qualifications).
- **JCD 1332 (2016)** — Appeals & Judicial Process (two-question test applied).
- **JCD 1333 (2016)** — Extension Ministries (missional needs determination; reporting; not a ¶2701 complaint).
- **JCD 1341 (2017)** — Jurisdictional & Central (who may appeal episcopal elections).
- **JCD 1343 (2017)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (cannot ignore standards; evidence from full exam).
- **JCD 1344 (2017)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (full inquiry mandated across relevant ¶¶).
- **JCD 1352 (2017)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (¾ written recommendation prerequisite).
- **JCD 1355 (2017)** — Retirement & Status (travel reimbursement; not compensation).
- **JCD 1361 (2018)** — Appeals & Judicial Process; Fair Process; Discontinuance (interlocutory admin appeals; stay; clergy standing; vote timing).
- **JCD 1366 (2018)** — Book of Discipline; Fair Process; Adaptation/Legality (principle of legality; separation of powers; Traditional Plan rulings).
- **JCD 1368 (2019)** — Board of Ordained Ministry; Candidacy (bishop may not exclude candidates; clergy session's role).
- **JCD 1371 (2019)** — Board of Trustees (limits on pre-emptive litigation authority).
- **JCD 1378 (2019)** — Book of Discipline; Church Trials (severability test; Traditional Plan).
- **JCD 1379 (2019)** — Annual Conference (ratification right); Disaffiliation (local); Apportionments (disaffiliation payments).
- **JCD 1383 (2019)** — Discontinuance; Fair Process (parts of admin processes unconstitutional; conflicted voting barred).
- **JCD 1385 (2019)** — Disaffiliation (¶2553 effective date).
- **JCD 1386 (2019)** — Disaffiliation (vote-fraud/effective-date context).
- **JCD 1401 (2021)** — Disaffiliation (¶2553 remained in effect; CGC lacked nullification authority).

- **JCD 1404 (2021)** — Board of Ordained Ministry; Candidacy (bishop cannot “ascertain and discern” eligibility).
- **JCD 1409 (2021)** — Apportionments; Connectional Entities (GCFA cannot change formulas absent GC).
- **JCD 1415 (2021)** — Board of Ordained Ministry; Annual Conference (aspirational statements vs violating the Discipline).
- **JCD 1419 (2021)** — Board of Ordained Ministry; Fair Process (CRC/ARC roles; notice; conflicts).
- **JCM 1408 (2021)** — Discontinuance; Fair Process (clarifies post-JCD 1383 fixes; non-voting rules).
- **JCM 1412 (2021)** — Disaffiliation (conference policy/steps memo).
- **JCD 1420 (2022)** — Board of Trustees; Disaffiliation (trustees’ authority; AC ratification is up-or-down).
- **JCD 1421 (2022)** — Board of Trustees; Disaffiliation (no pre-ratification transfers).
- **JCD 1422 (2022)** — Disaffiliation (scope of conference policy).
- **JCD 1424 (2022)** — Disaffiliation; Wespath/Benefits (additional standard terms allowed; pensions).
- **JCD 1425 (2022)** — Disaffiliation; Wespath/Benefits (re-states minimum standards incl. ¶1504.23).
- **JCD 1427 (2022)** — Delegates & Elections; Retirement (eligibility/vote separation; district-level participation).
- **JCD 1431 (2022)** — Apportionments (rejects reading JCD 1409 as making apportionments voluntary).
- **JCD 1432 (2022)** — Annual Conference (organizational motion order).
- **JCD 1436 (2022)** — Elections (district conference voting by order).
- **JCD 1440 (2022)** — Annual Conference (no business before organization).
- **JCD 1443 (2022)** — Charge Conference (DS must rule; minutes & certification).
- **JCD 1444 (2022)** — Disaffiliation (Annual Conferences may not separate).

- **JCM 1448 (2022)** — Annual Conference / Disaffiliation (null/void actions memo).
- **JCD 1449 (2022)** — Board of Trustees; Book of Discipline; Building Projects (¶2548.2 property transfers only; not a disaffiliation path).
- **JCD 1451 (2022)** — Delegates & Elections; Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (postponed 2020→2024 delegations).
- **JCD 1453 (2023)** — Disaffiliation (trustees' exclusive authority; ratification requirement).
- **JCD 1458 (2023)** — Discipline Enforcement & Compliance (ACs cannot negate GC legislation).
- **JCM 1452 (2023)** — Annual Conference (consent-calendar removal/handling); Wespath/Benefits Relations (pension-liability terms and ¶1504.23).
- **JCD 1472 (2023)** — Annual Conference; Delegates & Elections (filling vacancies via reserves first).
- **JCD 1476 (2023)** — Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (order of appeals on questions of law).
- **JCD 1479 (2023)** — Jurisdictional & Central Conferences (legacy delegations post-merger).
- **JCM 1485 (2023)** — Delegates & Elections; Jurisdictional & Central (no new elections except rare vacancy exhaustion; GC 2028 schedule).
- **JCD 1481 (2023)** — Records/Proceedings (electronic sessions; transparency/minutes).
- **JCD 1482 (2023)** — Candidacy & Membership; Church Membership; Discontinuance (credentials not surrendered by mere withdrawal; no dual membership).
- **JCD 1484 (2023)** — Board of Ordained Ministry; Church Trials; Fair Process (episcopal complaint processes constitutional).
- **JCD 1490 (2023)** — Building Projects; Church Closures; Discipline Compliance (exigent closure upheld; sequencing clarified).
- **JCD 1494 (2024)** — Church Trials (process boundaries; bishops & declaratory rulings).
- **JCD 1497 (2024)** — Elections (youth member inclusion on Commission on GC).
- **JCD 1499 (2024)** — Bishops (retired bishops' travel/expenses—two classes unconstitutional).

- **JCD 1500 (2024)** — Book of Discipline (no JC review of proposed constitutional amendments).
- **JCD 1503 (2024)** — Board of Trustees (facility policy re worship services; later narrowed).
- **JCD 1507 (2024)** — Charge Conference; Book/Compliance (cannot bypass CC; ¶2549 expansions struck).
- **JCD 1510 (2024)** — Annual Conference (voice/vote for active deaconesses/home missionaries).
- **JCD 1512 (2024)** — Board of Trustees; Church Closures & Discontinuance; Disaffiliation (Local Churches); Discipline Compliance; Book of Discipline (¶2549 not an exit path; trust clause connectionalism).
- **JCD 1513 (2024)** — Episcopal Areas & Boundaries (post-GC2024 bishop allocations; no cross-jurisdiction share conflicting with GC).
- **JCD 1514 (2024)** — Bishops; Retirement & Status; Candidacy & Membership (moot/hypothetical re service/chargeability; preserves status quo).
- **JCD 1515 (2024)** — Adaptation Powers; Book of Discipline (regionalization/severability framework).
- **JCD 1516 (2025)** — Board of Trustees (pastor's sole discretion for marriages; trustees cannot interfere; clarifies JCD 1503).
- **JCD 1517 (2025)** — Church Closures & Discontinuance; Board of Trustees; Disaffiliation (¶2549 cannot be used as exit; Dakotas case).
- **JCD 1518 (2025)** — Annual Conference; Board of Trustees; Connectional Entities/Compliance; Church Closures (Mississippi “process” null and void).
- **JCM 531 (1983)** — Retirement & Status (retired member eligible for GC/JC).
- **JCM 582 (1987)** — Annual Conference (CCFA budget must be presented to opening session).
- **JCM 663 (1991)** — Annual Conference (budget labeling/AC decision rights).
- **JCM 669 (1991)** — Wespath/Benefits (fiduciary settlement/settle-up).
- **JCM 701 (1993)** — Consultation (classic definition; timing/notice).
- **JCM 752 (1995)** — Wespath/Benefits (binding arbitration; reimbursement post-JCD 720).

- **JCM 950 (2002)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (DS/bishop participation barred in certain hearings).
- **JCM 1041 (2006)** — Church Membership (clarifies pastoral discretion under ¶4).
- **JCM 1129 (2009)** — Wespath/Benefits (plan sponsor/administrator interplay).
- **JCM 1186 (2011)** — Board of Ordained Ministry (no advisory opinion pre-AC action).
- **JCM 1200 (2011)** — Book of Discipline / Connectional Identity (unofficial organizations).
- **JCM 1276 (2014)** — Constitutional/Procedural (judicial restraint; GC fixes).
- **JCM 1301 (2015)** — Cabinet & Superintendency (appointive cabinet structure).
- **JCM 1302 (2015)** — Annual Conference (district conferences organization).
- **JCM 1408 (2021)** — Discontinuance; Fair Process (post-JCD 1383 clarifications).
- **JCM 1412 (2021)** — Disaffiliation (conference “discernment process” memo).
- **JCM 1442 (2022)** — Elections (floor nominations to BOM permitted).
- **JCM 1448 (2022)** — Disaffiliation (AC separation actions void—memorandum).
- **JCM 1452 (2023)** — Annual Conference (consent-calendar handling) and Wespath/Benefits Relations/Disaffiliation (pension withdrawal liability cannot be \$1; ¶1504.23 applies).
- **JCM 1485 (2023)** — Delegates & Elections; Jurisdictional & Central (postponement guidance—no new elections barring reserves exhaustion).